



AUDIT AND ADVISORY SERVICES
Tel: (510) 642-8292

611 UNIVERSITY HALL #1170
BERKELEY, CALIFORNIA 94720-1170

November 13, 2018

Interim Assistant Vice Chancellor and Chief Human Resources Officer Jo Mackness
Human Resources

Assistant Vice Provost Heather Archer
Academic Personnel Office

Interim Chief Human Resources Officer Mackness and Assistant Vice Provost Archer:

We have completed our Human Resources - Management and Supervisor Training audit as per our annual service plan in accordance with the Institute of Internal Auditors' *Standards for the Professional Practice of Internal Auditing* and the University of California Internal Audit Charter.

Our observations with management action plans are presented in the accompanying report. Please destroy all copies of draft reports and related documents. Thank you to the staff of Central Human Resources, the Academic Personnel Office, and various campus units for their cooperative efforts throughout the audit process. Please do not hesitate to call on Audit and Advisory Services if we can be of further assistance in this or other matters.

Respectfully reported,

Jamie Jue
Interim Director

cc: Executive Vice Chancellor and Provost Paul Alivisatos
Vice Chancellor Marc Fisher
Vice Provost Ben Hermalin
Associate Chancellor Khira Griscavage
Assistant Vice Chancellor and Controller Delphine Regalia
Senior Vice President and Chief Compliance and Audit Officer Alexander Bustamante



AUDIT AND ADVISORY SERVICES

Human Resources - Management and Supervisor Training Audit

Project No. 18-711

November 13, 2018

Prepared by:

Reviewed and Approved by:

Dorothy Lipari
Auditor-in-Charge

Jaime Jue
Interim Director

University of California, Berkeley
Audit and Advisory Services
Human Resources - Management and Supervisor Training

Table of Contents

OVERVIEW	2
Executive Summary	2
Source and Purpose of the Audit	4
Scope of the Audit	4
Background Information.....	4
Summary Conclusion.....	5
SUMMARY OF OBSERVATIONS & MANAGEMENT RESPONSE AND ACTION PLAN	7
Ongoing Manager Training.....	7
Responsibilities for People Managers.....	8
Adapting Training for Academic Managers	9

OVERVIEW

Executive Summary

The purpose of the audit was to assess the adequacy and effectiveness of programs to equip managers and supervisors on campus with the skills necessary to lead and manage a high performing workforce in the areas of recruitment, performance management, employee and labor relations, and professional development.

The audit scope included both non-academic and academic managers. The review covered the governance structure and relevant policies and guidance associated with manager training and development, expectations for managers, and training availability and delivery. The nature and extent of the various programs and classes available to managers were also considered.

We observed that many high-quality training resources and supporting materials are available to people managers through the UC Learning Center and other means. The training resources and delivery channels generally appear adequate in terms of relevant content. We identified process opportunities for further improvement in three areas:

Training for Non-Academic Managers and Supervisors

- There is an opportunity to re-organize and further curate the content of the Manager and Supervisor section of the Learning & Development website to provide better guidance on what courses are most relevant for particular topics or employee categories. The presentation of the current content, while interesting and applicable, could be seen as voluminous and difficult to navigate.
- The development and use of key operational metrics would allow assessment of the impact of manager training on overall manager effectiveness, whether resources should be re-allocated among various training options, and whether delivery methods should be modified and enhanced.

Enhancing Communication on Expectations of Manager and Supervisor Responsibilities and Core Competencies

- There is an opportunity to enhance where and how people management responsibilities for managers and supervisors are defined and communicated. Existing campus guidance does not explicitly state such responsibilities. While Central Human Resources (HR) has articulated management competencies for leads, supervisors, and managers, it is not clear that these competencies are widely known or commonly and consistently applied in practice.
- The overall effectiveness of training efforts could be reinforced by concurrently ensuring manager and supervisor responsibilities are also incorporated in the design and implementation of job classifications, annual goal setting, and annual performance management processes.

Manager and Supervisor Training for Academic Managers

- Recognizing that academic personnel often have prioritized teaching and research responsibilities, the emphasis and approach to training academic managers and supervisors may need to be adapted to the academic environment. Emphasis could be placed on general knowledge and developing expectations of consulting and partnering with subject-matter experts (such as HR generalists) or departmental administration, rather than expecting a breadth of knowledge to handle a range of human resource matters directly.
- The mentoring culture in academic units creates an opportunity for mentors to provide standard and tailored information about academic manager responsibilities and manager training directly to mentees.
- There is an opportunity for the Academic Personnel Office (APO) and Central HR to discuss and assess the extent to which the content of existing manager training resources and materials for administrative staff could be readily converted to an academic context, understanding that acceptance of training opportunities may be greater if there is communication and support from the executive vice chancellor and provost (EVCP) or vice provost for the faculty on the importance of such topics.

Source and Purpose of the Audit

The purpose of the audit was to assess the adequacy and effectiveness of programs to equip managers and supervisors on campus with the skills necessary to lead and manage a high performing workforce in the areas of recruitment, performance management, employee and labor relations, and professional development.

Scope of the Audit

The audit scope included both non-academic and academic managers. Training for non-management and executive personnel was not included in this review. The review covered the governance structure, relevant policies and guidance, and operations related to manager training and development, expectations for managers, and training availability and delivery. The nature and extent of the various programs and classes available to managers was also considered. Our audit fieldwork was conducted between October 2017 and May 2018.

Background Information

Generally speaking, an effective workforce manager encompasses a set of learned behaviors supported by developed skills and competencies, all within the framework and requirements of a specific organizational environment. Each organization defines what makes an effective workforce manager in their environment.

Managers and supervisors are critical to the day-to-day operations of the campus. They hold technical expertise and are charged with obtaining, organizing, directing, managing, and stewarding both physical and human resources. They are a critical link between senior leadership and employees. Their success depends on their ability to guide and develop their employees to successfully perform their job responsibilities and achieve desired organizational results.

Training of workforce managers is critical in that training is a primary means of developing the campus' overall manager effectiveness by improving each manager's knowledge, skills, and competencies; communicating general knowledge of the organization and its key management and compliance requirements, and exposing them to the current issues.

The following training resources related to improving manager and supervisor effectiveness are provided by Central HR and are open to all managers on campus, except as noted:

- *KEYS Program*. The main training program for existing managers is the Keys to Enhance Your Supervisory Success (KEYS) program. Completion of the program is marked by a certificate of completion and a six-month follow-up with the attendee and the attendee's management.
- *UC People Management Series*¹ is an online series of classes which leads to a certificate of completion.
- *Lynda.com*. This is a LinkedIn product that provides access to several thousand on-line trainings, including technical, management, and soft skills topics. Lynda.com replaced SkillSoft in 2016.

¹ <https://ucnet.universityofcalifornia.edu/working-at-uc/your-career/talent-management/people-management-series-and-certificate/index.html>

- *Thriving as a Manager* lecture series consists of four four-hour presentations spread over a year. This is a high-level training program. Roughly 80 managers can attend each session.

In addition, informal training and social support is provided through the *Wisdom Café* (learn and share with colleagues), *Berkeley Manager News*, Staff Ombuds Office (workshops to help manage and resolve conflicts in the workplace), tool kits, self assessments, and a team building book list. The Management Development Program (MDP) and the Senior Leadership Program (SLP) have been sunsetted due to budget constraints.

Central HR has recently developed training modules for HR staff within both the HR non-academic and academic job families. This training assists HR staff to more effectively support their assigned areas, including the workforce managers. Central HR currently uses the UC Learning Center to track classes required, scheduled, and taken, and anticipates continuing to use the UC Learning Management System (LMS).

The EVCP Office and the Vice Provost for the Faculty Office in cooperation with the APO offers the annual *New Chairs Program*. This program provides various information needed by the department chairs to carry out their responsibilities at Berkeley. It includes technical topics and soft skills (conflict resolution and handling of confidential information, among other topics), however, the program only marginally covers management of people. The APO is not further involved in training of academic managers. The EVCP Office, however, is sponsoring a *New Faculty Leadership Development Program*. We understand that since the completion of our audit fieldwork, the new deans onboarding orientation is being revamped and a faculty leadership program, targeting mid-level career faculty, is being developed.

Summary Conclusion

We observed that many high-quality training resources and supporting materials are available to people managers through the UC Learning Center and other means. The training resources and delivery channels generally appear adequate in terms of relevant content. We identified certain process opportunities for further improvement in three areas:

Training for Non-Academic Managers and Supervisors

- There is an opportunity to re-organize and further curate the content of the Manager and Supervisor section of the Learning & Development website to provide better guidance on what courses are most relevant for particular topics or employee categories. The presentation of the current content, while interesting and applicable, could be seen as voluminous and difficult to navigate.
- The development and use of key operational metrics would allow assessment of the impact of manager training on overall manager effectiveness, whether resources should be re-allocated among various training options, and whether delivery methods should be modified and enhanced.

Enhancing Communication on Expectations of Manager and Supervisor Responsibilities and Core Competencies

- There is an opportunity to enhance where and how people management responsibilities for managers and supervisors are defined and communicated. Existing campus guidance does not explicitly state such responsibilities. While Central Human Resources (HR) has articulated management competencies for leads, supervisors, and managers, it is not clear that these competencies are widely known or commonly and consistently applied in practice.
- The overall effectiveness of training efforts could be reinforced by concurrently ensuring manager and supervisor responsibilities are also incorporated in the design and implementation of job classifications, annual goal setting, and annual performance management processes.

Manager and Supervisor Training for Academic Managers

- Recognizing that academic personnel often have prioritized teaching and research responsibilities, the emphasis and approach to training academic managers and supervisors may need to be adapted to the academic environment. Emphasis could be placed on general knowledge and developing expectations of consulting and partnering with subject-matter experts (such as HR generalists) or departmental administration, rather than expecting a breadth of knowledge to handle a range of human resource matters directly.
- The mentoring culture in academic units creates an opportunity for mentors to provide standard and tailored information about academic manager responsibilities and manager training directly to mentees.
- There is an opportunity for the APO and Central HR to discuss and assess the extent to which the content of existing manager training resources and materials for administrative staff could be readily converted to an academic context, understanding that acceptance of training opportunities may be greater if there is communication and support from the EVCP or vice provost for the faculty on the importance of such topics.

SUMMARY OF OBSERVATIONS & MANAGEMENT RESPONSE AND ACTION PLAN

Ongoing Manager Training

Observation

Central HR has made many high-quality training resources (courses and materials) available related to many people management topics. The longstanding *Keys to Enhance Your Supervisory Success* (KEYS) and more recent *UC People Management Certificate* programs are two structured programs that are designed to build core competencies in recruitment, hiring, goal setting, performance evaluation, conflict management, coaching, and corrective action processes, among others. The former program is primarily delivered in a classroom setting, whereas the latter is delivered through online courses available in the UC Learning Management System. Beyond these programs, there are individual courses and other resources and support available through Lynda.com, the Manager Excellence Resource Center (MERC) (formerly provided by the Corporate Executive Board and now Gartner), and the Wisdom Café.

We identified an opportunity to assist interested parties navigating the Manager and Supervisor section of the Learning & Development website by re-organizing or curating the information therein to provide better guidance on what courses would be most relevant for particular topics, particularly for online courses and resources through Lynda.com, UC Learning Center, MERC, or the Wisdom Café. Our observation is that the content, while interesting and relevant, could be seen as voluminous, difficult to navigate, and even overwhelming.

We also identified an opportunity for new management in Learning & Development to develop structures to better understand the usage and effectiveness of available training resources on people management topics. Developing and implementing key operational metrics would allow for an assessment of the impact such training has on overall manager effectiveness, whether resources should be re-allocated among different training options, and whether delivery methods should be modified.

Management Response and Action Plan

Human Resources

We have undergone a full website redesign to address the issues mentioned above. The update includes creating branding for the Central HR Learning & Development (L&D) function using the term GROW. The new website, set to launch in fall 2018, will be built on five pillars: Grow Your Skills, Grow Your Career, Grow Your Engagement, Grow Your Resources, and Grow Your Community.

Each pillar will have its own web presence, making the site far more user centric and friendly. The redesigned Grow Your Skills page will address all of the observations from paragraph one and two above, by curating the learning resources into categories including:

- Learning Opportunities for Everyone
- Learning Opportunities for Leadership Development
- Learning Opportunities for Professionals

- Learning Opportunities from our Campus Partners
- System-wide Learning Opportunities
- Informal and Social Learning Opportunities

In tandem with these upgrades, we have hired a new business analyst who will work with our data analytics team to better understand usage and effectiveness of learning resources made available through L&D. We are also investigating a partnership with the organization Metrics that Matter to determine if we can partner with an outside vendor to build deeper data analytics systems to help the team make the best strategic decisions. While this option may prove cost prohibitive, we are certain our use of Qualtrics software, web analytics, usage data, and LMS analytics will enhance our ability to address the observation mentioned in paragraph three.

Responsibilities for People Managers

Observation

Learning objectives are foundational to the development of any structured training program and are often derived from strategic objectives, operational goals, and compliance requirements. We identified an opportunity for senior management to formally and succinctly define responsibilities for managers and supervisors with respect to managing people. Existing campus guidance, including the comprehensive *Guide to Managing Human Resources*², does not explicitly state responsibilities of managers and supervisors in terms of their capacity as a manager and leader of people. We examined a sample of the generic scope (shared across functions) on job standards for supervisors and managers in the Berkeley Job Builder website and noted that specific responsibilities for managing others was very high level and did not describe specific responsibilities with respect to managing employees.

Central HR has articulated management competencies for leads, supervisors, and managers in four areas (strategic focus, operational focus, employee focus, and workplace focus) with specific key skills in each of these areas. However, through our interviews, we observed it is not clear that these competencies are widely known or commonly and consistently applied in practice.

Training should not be the sole mechanism through which campus managers and supervisors continually improve their people management effectiveness. Manager responsibilities could be systematically incorporated into job descriptions, training curricula, goal setting, and performance management. Defining and reinforcing manager responsibilities would help ensure subsequent alignment between communicating desired behaviors, developing and implementing focused training programs, and measuring and evaluating against desired outcomes. We believe there is an opportunity for greater coordination in Central HR across Total Rewards, Organizational Effectiveness, and Learning & Development to ensure that job descriptions, annual goal setting, learning and development opportunities, and annual performance management emphasize development of people management skills for managers and supervisors in a coordinated manner.

Promoting a common set of manager responsibilities in job descriptions, establishing performance goals related to management development in annual goal setting (such as training goals), and

² In the campus *Guide to Managing Human Resources*, Central HR’s Statement on Philosophy states that, “Because of their role, managers and supervisors have a special responsibility to lead, and to lead in a manner which fosters and maintains an environment of respect for each person.”

evaluating performance against those goals through the annual performance management process are complementary processes that can enhance manager and supervisor effectiveness in people management.

Management Response and Action Plan

Human Resources

We agree that training should not be the sole mechanism through which campus managers and supervisors continually improve their people management effectiveness. To that end, the Central HR Objectives, Goals, Strategy, Plans sets the objective of advancing to become “Berkeley’s Proactive People Partner”. At our most recent leadership retreat, our leadership team started to explore areas for collaboration that include Learning & Development, Organizational Effectiveness, Total Rewards, and Operations.

Additionally, related to defining and reinforcing managerial responsibility, we have fully redesigned the KEYS program into a four-layered leadership development journey meant to reach staff at four distinct points in their career progression:

- Aspiring leaders: Berkeley People Management Grow Today Certificate Series
- New leaders at Berkeley: Berkeley People Management Grow Your Knowledge Certificate Series
- Leaders ready to take their team to the next level: Berkeley People Management Grow Your Team Certificate Series
- Senior/executive leadership: Berkeley People Management Grow the Organization Certificate Series.

These new programs will be launching in January, 2019. Each of these series include face-to-face learning opportunities, complimented with assessments and informal/social learning opportunities such as DiSC assessment, 360-degree evaluation, and executive coaching to fully engage our campus learners and make the most impact.

At the same time, we are reworking the annual performance management process to include continuous conversations between managers and staff, an enhancement that will only be achieved through deep collaborations and coordination between the Total Rewards team, Organizational Effectiveness team, and Learning & Development team.

Adapting Training for Academic Managers

Observation

Managers and supervisors with responsibilities for managing people in an academic environment likely encounter similar issues and challenges as those in an administrative (non-academic) environment. While both have unique collective bargaining agreements, academic personnel policies and guidance are outlined in the Academic Personnel Manual, and non-academic personnel policies and guidance are included in the Personnel Policies for Staff Members (PPSM). The day-to-day administration of personnel matters is assigned to the APO under the vice provost for the faculty. Protocols and processes in place for communicating job expectations as well as annual goal setting and performance evaluation vary between the academic and non-academic settings.

In the academic setting, we understand there is less reliance on formal classroom or online training programs and more reliance on mentorship or programs developed within individual schools, colleges, or departments for knowledge sharing and job-related training. Also recognizing that academic personnel often have more prioritized teaching and research responsibilities, the emphasis and approach to training on matters related to manager and supervisor effectiveness may need to be adapted to ensure success with this population.

First, the breadth of practical knowledge of people management topics could be defined to be narrower than that of an administrative manager or supervisor, with greater emphasis on contacting subject-matter experts (HR generalists) or peers (department chairs or chief administrative officers) as more complicated situations arise. In such an event, communication and training could be focused on more commonly encountered situations in an academic setting. The question of whether such training should be mandatory for a subset or the entire population of academic personnel with such personnel management responsibilities would need to be carefully considered. In either case, communication may be warranted to emphasize that leading successful teams conducting research or teaching requires having at least rudimentary knowledge of how to successfully manage people, including how to identify that a human resources matter is present and how to obtain help to best address the situation.

Second, we understand that mentorship as a practice in academia is also commonly found on campus as a means to transfer knowledge between both established and newer or more junior personnel. Given that mentorship is often an informal process within a department or school, there may be an opportunity to provide selected information to mentors that can be covered with their mentee, along with appropriate contact information if there are further questions. Alternatively, new department chair training could be augmented to include a primer on people management topics, coupled with an expectation that a summary of such information would be brought back for presentation and discussion at the individual department level.

Third, given that the existence of a large amount of training content already exists for administrative managers, we believe there may be an opportunity for Central HR and the APO to discuss and evaluate the extent to which such content could be readily converted and applied to an academic context. We understand that acceptance of training opportunities may be greater if there is communication and support from the EVCP or vice provost for the faculty on the importance of such topics.

Management Response and Action Plan

Academic Personnel Office

It is clearly beneficial to both the University and individual units if all managers have well-developed skillsets to manage individuals and teams. However, we are also aware of the need for a nuanced approach for academics (those in faculty and researcher series, among others) serving as managers given the limitations on their time and their focus on conducting research, fulfilling their service obligations, and, for faculty, teaching. This time constraint is especially acute for those appointed at the Assistant rank in titles subject to the eight-year limit at that rank. Our goal is to build up the needed skillset in a way that works for academics and in a way that makes the best use of their time.

Establishing local cohorts and mentoring programs are avenues that we feel would be most effective with academics who are new to the campus. A curated set of online trainings (more on this below) can be provided to mentors and given to mentees as needs arise.

More formal training can be offered to all academics but targeted towards more established (tenured or long-term appointees) academics who need to either brush up on or develop people management skills.

Some options for delivering formal training include adding a specific people management section to the *New Chairs Program* (a program managed out of the vice provost for the faculty's office) and the corresponding program for new deans (a program managed out of the executive vice chancellor & provost's office). It is worth noting that such sections are part of the 2018–19 series of both programs. In addition, academics will be encouraged to take advantage of relevant leadership training opportunities, such as the *UC Women's Initiative for Professional Development* or the *Faculty Leadership Academy*, which aim to enhance their overall management skills.

The APO, in collaboration with staff [Central] HR, will create a curated set of academic-relevant online trainings. The APO will also partner with staff HR to identify which, if any, components of the revamped KEYS curriculum are relevant to academic managers and explore piloting a version to an academic audience.

In order to reach non-faculty academic managers, such as academic coordinators, researchers, project scientists, librarians, and even postdoctoral scholars, the curated set of available trainings would be sent to academic units on an annual basis from the vice provost for the faculty asking the chairs, deans, and directors to encourage their academics to participate, as needed, as part of their professional development.

In summary, we feel a multi-faceted approach that includes local mentoring and cohort groups, campus-wide trainings, online trainings/resources, and formal leadership programs is needed to build up and reinforce the skills of academic managers. The continued partnership between the APO and staff HR will also be necessary so changes to programs and new leadership opportunities are shared in a timely fashion.